

LOGIC AND REASONING IN RELATION TO GURBANI

Introduction

There is a very strong view that “logic and reasoning” is the approach prescribed in Gurbani to learning and understanding Gurbani because it is in line with “modern thinking”. There is another view that Logic and Reasoning has no place in Gurbani and cite this to be Manmat (ਮਨਮਤ).

This paper addresses this issue. First the two views are presented followed by an analysis of what Gurbani states and analyse the two views from the Gurbani perspective. We end with a conclusion.

It is shown that it is a **folly to interpret Gurbani** based solely on **logic and reasoning** without the considering “spirituality” and the “living presence”. The “living presence” is the presence of God in the creation which Gurbani refers to as Hukam (ਹੁਕਮ) and Jot (ਜੋਤ).

Additionally without Gurbani teaching (Gurmat) we **cannot use our logic or reasoning** to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) as this will be biased by our five evils. **Our Gurus had decided through their own methods what we are to learn** through all our scriptures and **our role** is to **contemplate and reflect** on these teachings and then put them into **practice**.

The view that “logic and reasoning” is Manmat (ਮਨਮਤ) is correct to a large extend. This is because we use Gurbani teachings or Gurmat to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) otherwise our decisions this will be biased by our five evils.

NOTE: It is extremely important to appreciate the word spirituality (ਅਧਿਆਤਮ) according to Gurbani. The seat of spirituality lies in the Antahkaran and which is our inner self and generally not visible externally. The reader is alluded to this word but the meaning is not taken up in this document (Note the example below relating to Guru Nanak’s visit to the mosque with the Kadhi gives a gist of this concept).

The two views of learning Gurbani

View A: Logic and reasoning is manmat (ਮਨਮਤਿ)

This view is that learning Gurbani using reasoning is Manmat (ਮਨਮਤ). This view espouses that dharam is beyond the normal thinking process and prescribes total (unquestioned) faith in the scriptures. Essentially just follow what the scriptures teach us.

View B: Logic and reasoning is approach prescribed in Gurbani

The view cites that Guru Nanak's method used logic and reasoning as follows to reject the following

- wearing of the Janeau because his sister did not wear it
- rejecting caste since it divides society
- The practice of throwing water to the Sun at Hardwar
- The Arti at Jaganath temple
- saying prayers in a certain direction

and other ritualistic practices.

This view states that, the whole of Sri Guru Granth Sahib (SGGS) is a discourse in "logic and reasoning". Sharda is faith based on knowing first and then believing. This view claims that SGGS teaches spiritual knowledge hinged on the following.

1. Spiritual knowledge through sound logic and reason (i.e. SGGS is persuasive logical discourse).
2. Reason and logical argument against spiritual (ritual and blind faith) practices.
3. The Shabad based journey is practical for modern times where knowledge (ਗਿਆਨ) generates faith.
4. The word Shabad by definition is logical reasoning because the SGGS and hence Shabad is spirituality based on logical reasoning.

Some verses quoted to support this view are as follows.

- ਦਇਆ ਕਪਾਹ ਸੰਤੋਖੁ ਸੂਤੁ ਜਤੁ ਗੰਢੀ ਸਤੁ ਵਟੁ ॥ ਏਹੁ ਜਨੇਊ ਜੀਅ ਕਾ ਹਈ ਤ ਪਾਡੇ ਘਤੁ ॥
- ਗਗਨ ਮੈ ਥਾਲੁ ਰਵਿ ਚੰਦੁ ਦੀਪਕ ਬਨੇ ਤਾਰਿਕਾ ਮੰਡਲ ਜਨਕ ਮੋਤੀ ॥ ...
- ਨਗਨ ਫਿਰਤ ਜੋ ਪਾਈਐ ਜੋਗੁ ॥ ਬਨ ਕਾ ਮਿਰਗੁ ਮੁਕਤਿ ਸਭੁ ਹੋਗੁ ॥੧॥
- ਮੂਡ ਮੁੰਡਾਏ ਜੋ ਸਿਧਿ ਪਾਈ ॥ ਮੁਕਤੀ ਭੇਡ ਨ ਗਈਆ ਕਾਈ ॥੨॥
- ਬਿੰਦੁ ਰਾਖਿ ਜੋ ਤਰੀਐ ਭਾਈ ॥ ਖੁਸਰੈ ਕਿਉ ਨ ਪਰਮ ਗਤਿ ਪਾਈ ॥੩॥

The last three dot points are from the same shabad.

Analysis

First point to understand is the meaning of the word MANMAT (ਮਨਮਤਿ). This word according to Mahan Kosh means one does "what the MAN (ਮਨ) wants" and follows "the principle set by the MAN". This means we follow the intellect of the mind. This is what Gurbani says about MANMAT

ਮਨਮਤਿ ਝੂਠੀ ਸਚਾ ਸੋਇ ॥ SGGS 222 M:1 Gaurdee Guarayree

The intellect of the mind is false; only the Lord is True.

This means that when we follow our MAN's intellect then we focus on MAYA (which is false in the sense that the aspect of MAYA we are focusing on will perish).

Now let us look next at what the meaning of LOGIC (ਤਰਕੁ, ਮੰਤਕ, ਨਿਆਇ) /REASON (ਤਰਕੁ, ਵਿਵੇਚਨ, ਵਿਚਾਰ, ਯੁਕਤੀ) is. LOGIC is reasoning conducted or accessed according to strict principles of validity. REASONING is to identify the cause, or explain or justify an action or event AND the power of the mind to think, understand, and form judgements logically.

Let us see what Gurbani has to say about LOGIC/REASONING (ਤਰਕੁ, ਮੰਤਕ, ਨਿਆਇ, ਵਿਵੇਚਨ, ਵਿਚਾਰ, ਯੁਕਤੀ). Gurbani is silent on the word ਮੰਤਕ and ਵਿਵੇਚਨ. Another word that may be invoked to mean logic is BUDHI (ਬੁਧੀ).

We will study ਤਰਕੁ, ਨਿਆਇ, ਵਿਚਾਰ and ਬੁਧੀ.

First analyse ਤਰਕੁ through Namdev's shabad SGGS 693 Namdev Dhanasari.

ਪਹਿਲ ਪੁਰੀਏ ਪੁੰਡਰਕ ਵਨਾ ॥ ਤਾ ਚੇ ਹੰਸਾ ਸਗਲੇ ਜਨਾਂ ॥ ਕ੍ਰਿਸ਼ਨਾ ਤੇ ਜਾਨਉ ਹਰਿ ਹਰਿ ਨਾਚੰਤੀ ਨਾਚਨਾ ॥੧॥

First of all, the lotuses bloomed in the woods; from them, all the swan-souls came into being. Know that, through Krishna, the Lord, Har, Har, the dance of creation dances. ||1||

ਪਹਿਲ ਪੁਰਸਾਬਿਰਾ ॥ ਅਥੋਨ ਪੁਰਸਾਦਮਰਾ ॥ ਅਸਗਾ ਅਸ ਉਸਗਾ ॥ ਹਰਿ ਕਾ ਬਾਗਰਾ ਨਾਚੈ ਪਿੰਧੀ ਮਹਿ ਸਾਗਰਾ ॥੧॥ ਰਹਾਉ ॥

First of all, there was only the Primal Being. From that Primal Being, Maya was produced. All that is, is His. In this Garden of the Lord, we all dance, like water in the pots of the Persian wheel. ||1||Pause||

ਨਾਚੰਤੀ ਗੋਪੀ ਜੰਨਾ ॥ ਨਈਆ ਤੇ ਬੈਰੇ ਕੰਨਾ ॥ ਤਰਕੁ ਨ ਚਾ ॥ ਭ੍ਰਮੀਆ ਚਾ ॥ ਕੇਸਵਾ ਬਚਉਨੀ ਅਈਏ ਮਈਏ ਏਕ ਆਨ ਜੀਉ ॥੨॥

Women and men both dance. There is no other than the Lord. Don't **dispute** this, and don't doubt this. The Lord says, "This creation and I are one and the same."||2||

In the third verse of the shabad the word reason is used. Gurbani talks about creation and the goings-on in the creation. God existed before creation, God created the creation (MAYA) which “dances” according to the tune of God. Now comes the important part. Don't dispute means **don't try to reason or logically deduce** (ਤਰਕੁ ਨ ਚਾ), don't even doubt this (ਭ੍ਰਮੀਆ ਚਾ)

that God's (ਕੇਸਵਾ) Hukam (ਬਚਉਨੀ) pervades (ਏਕ ਆਨ ਜੀਓ) the creation (ਅਈਏ ਮਈਏ - man and woman metaphorically means the creation).

It is interesting to note that Namdev states **don't try to reason that God pervades the entire creation.**

Let us see what Gurbani has to say about ਨਿਆਇ. This word is essentially used in Gurbani to mean “**justice**”

- from God (SGGS 148, 306, 315, 621)
- by people in position of power (SGGS 951) [Gurbani through this Shabad relates about people who are actually doing wrong].

We can ignore this word for our purposes.

The next word is ਵਿਚਾਰ (in the form ਵਿਚਾਰੁ, ਵਿਚਾਰੀ, ਵੀਚਾਰ, ਵੀਚਾਰਾ, ਵੀਚਾਰੁ, ਵੀਚਾਰੇ, ਵੀਚਾਰੀਆ, ਵੀਚਾਰਹਿ, ਵੀਚਾਰੇ and ਵੀਚਾਰੈ). The meanings are as follows:

- SGGS 1 Japji Sahib: ਗਾਵੈ ਕੋ ਵਿਦਿਆ ਵਿਖਮੁ ਵੀਚਾਰੁ the meaning here is **philosophical study**.
- SGGS 2 Japji Sahib: ਅੰਮ੍ਰਿਤ ਵੇਲਾ ਸਚੁ ਨਾਉ ਵਡਿਆਈ ਵਿਚਾਰੁ the meaning is **contemplate** i.e. “think about” the greatness of God; **note** “think about” does not mean **reason or logical** activity.
- SGGS 931: ਗੁਣ ਵਿਚਾਰੇ ਗਿਆਨੀ ਸੋਇ ॥ Again here the word means contemplate. But in this case the wise ones contemplate (on God).
- SGGS 3 Japji Sahib ਜੇ ਕੋ ਕਹੈ ਕਰੈ ਵਿਚਾਰੁ ॥ ਕਰਤੇ ਕੈ ਕਰਣੈ ਨਾਹੀ ਸੁਮਾਰੁ ॥ Here Gurbani is saying no matter how much we “explain and describe”, by logic and reason, the actions of God i.e. what God does are beyond our comprehension.
- Similarly other related meanings are God's creative potency ਵਿਚਾਰੁ, ਵੀਚਾਰ, ਵੀਚਾਰੁ (SGGS 3, 4, 5), Sadhus contemplate ਵੀਚਾਰੇ on God (SGGS 6). Again these do not imply logic and reasoning.
- Also other meaning imply one's helplessness in understanding ਵਿਚਾਰੇ God (SGGS 167, 441, 448,
- SGGS 588: ਨਾਨਕ ਵਿਣੁ ਨਾਵੈ ਨਿਰਭਉ ਕੋ ਨਹੀ ਜਿਚਰੁ ਸਬਦਿ ਨ ਕਰੇ ਵਿਚਾਰੁ ॥੧॥ Here again the meaning is **contemplate** i.e. “think about” the greatness of God.
- SGGS 589: ਸਤਿਗੁਰ ਕੀ ਸੇਵ ਨ ਕੀਨੀਆ ਕਿਆ ਓਹੁ ਕਰੇ ਵਿਚਾਰੁ ॥ Here the meaning is if you do serve the True Guru (i.e. acquire Gurmat) how can you **reflect** on God.

- SGGS 788: ਜਿਸੁ ਬੁਝਾਇਹਿ ਸੋ ਬੁਝਸੀ ਸਚਿਆ ਕਿਆ ਜੰਤ ਵਿਚਾਰੀ ॥੮॥ God causes us to **understand** God. “Understand” means **an inspiration** sort of like “eureka”; a realisation. Other related meanings (ਵਿਚਾਰੁ, ਵਿਚਾਰੇ) in SGGS 589, 750, 796 and 982.
- There are numerous (hundreds) other words meaning “contemplate”, “explain and describe”, “understand”, “reflection”, “consideration” ਵੀਚਾਰ, ਵੀਚਾਰਾ ਵੀਚਾਰੁ, ਵੀਚਾਰੀ, ਵੀਚਾਰੈ, ਵੀਚਾਰੀਐ, ਵੀਚਾਰੀਆ, ਵੀਚਾਰਹਿ, ਵੀਚਾਰੋ are found at SGGS for example on pages 4, 34, 59, 63, 121, 160, 226, 234, 306, 411, 549, 607, 768, 903, 1009, 1130, 1257, 1331, 1413, 1418, 1429.

Just like in the case of the meaning in the Shabad by Namdev, the word **ਵਿਚਾਰ** in Gurbani also **does not point towards logic and reasoning** for God realisation.

Finally let us look at BUDHI (ਬੁਧਿ, ਬੁਧੀ) in Gurbani. The meanings are as follows.

- SGGS 8: ਤਿਥੈ ਘੜੀਐ ਸੁਰਤਿ ਮਤਿ ਮਨਿ ਬੁਧਿ ॥ Here it means intellect.
- SGGS 62: ਮਨਹਠ ਬੁਧੀ ਕੇਤੀਆ ਕੇਤੇ ਬੇਦ ਬੀਚਾਰ ॥ Here it means intellect. Likewise ਬੁਧੀ in SGGS 151 also means intellect.
- SGGS 772: ਬਿਬੇਕ ਬੁਧੀ ਸੁਖਿ ਰੈਣਿ ਵਿਹਾਣੀ ਗੁਰਮਤਿ ਨਾਮਿ ਪ੍ਰਗਾਸਾ ॥ Here it means ability to discriminate between good and bad actions (ਬਿਬੇਕ) intellect. The phrase ਬੁਧਿ ਬਿਬੇਕ (e.g. SGGS 52) or ਬਿਬੇਕ ਬੁਧਿ (e.g. SGGS 317) is also used with this same meaning.
- SGGS 941: ਗੁਰਮੁਖਿ ਅਸਟ ਸਿਧੀ ਸਭਿ ਬੁਧੀ ॥ Here it means wisdom. Similarly ਬੁਧੀ in SGGS 1241 and 1413 also means wisdom.

Essentially ਬੁਧਿ, ਬੁਧੀ means intellect or wisdom. However when it occurs in combination with ਬਿਬੇਕ (e.g. SGGS 772) it means intellect with the ability to discriminate between good and bad actions based on Gurmat (teaching of Gurbani). The core meaning is still intellect.

The methods prescribed are **contemplation** and **reflection** and we will get **inspiration** and God **realisation** will set in. This is evidenced by the verse in JapJi.

ਸੋਚੈ ਸੋਚਿ ਨ ਹੋਵਈ ਜੇ ਸੋਚੀ ਲਖ ਵਾਰ ॥ SGGS 1 JapJi

By thinking, He cannot be reduced to thought, even by thinking hundreds of thousands of times

So the solution, as stated earlier, is **contemplation and reflection**.

In addition to this there is a need to **learn Gurmat through Gurbani so that we learn how to discriminate with good and bad actions** (ਬਿਬੇਕ ਬੁਧੀ). This is termed discriminative intelligence.

Logic, as classically defined, is practically impossible to apply in spirituality because of the subjective nature of actions being classified as good or bad. This is where Gurmat comes in, and where we acquire this ability. As an example when one looks at one performing an action one does not know what is in one's mind. Recall when Guru Nanak attended the mosque with the Kadhi. Guru Nanak knew what was in the Kadhi's mind when the Kadhi was conducting the prayers, but to us for example the Kadhi would be performing a good action, but in reality his mind (spirit ਅਧਿਆਤਮ) appears focused on God (but was actually elsewhere as Guru Nanak knew). Therefore **discriminative intellect is for us to judge ourselves** not others.

On the other hand "View B" is that the whole of **Gurbani is essentially reasoning and logic**. This is a huge **CONTRADICTION** with Gurbani. What is going on?

Gurbani says CONTEMPLATION AND REFLECTION and INSPIRATION will come; and the other says use LOGIC AND REASON and you are on the right path. THIS IS A VERY CONFUSING STATE OF AFFAIRS.

Let us try to understand this DIRE STATE OF AFFAIRS. When we analyse "View B", we note one thing. The **examples given and the verses quoted** are all **related to the actions** performed through one's five action organs (as a part of our living in this world). This view is used to justify that Gurbani is from A to Z reasoning and logic. Gurbani does point to actions (rituals) in some sections, but this is not necessarily the general case where Gurbani advises us to contemplate and reflect to achieve God realisation. These actions section of **Gurbani is the teaching to us (Gurmat) which gives us the discriminate intellect (ਬਿਬੇਕ ਬੁਧੀ) to identify between what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad)**. Truly there is no question of logic or reason. We have to learn, understand what Gurbani teaches us and apply it in our lives. **WITHOUT GURBANI TEACHING WE CANNOT USE OUR LOGIC OR REASONING** to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) as this will be biased by our five evils. **Any logic or reasoning**, in fact the word **CONTEMPLATION and REFLECTION is more appropriate**, we use will **only be in the PROCESS OF OUR UNDERSTANDING the teaching of Gurbani**. **Our Gurus had decided through their own methods** (inspiration, logic, reasoning, contemplation, reflection and any other – it is outside our capacity to define how they made this decision) **what we are to learn** through all

our scriptures. Our role is to **contemplate and reflect** on these teaching and then put them into **practice**.

We can call this input/output through our sense/action organs PICTURES. Another article about “thoughts” available at the link (copy and paste in browser) below throws some light in this area and is worth a read.

<https://www.dropbox.com/s/7z1mxalvg4wjk19/160809%20Thoughts.pdf?dl=0>

We continue our discussion. To understand this we have to look at our antahkaran. The MAN in the antahkaran is the source of all our actions through the action organs. The input to the decision making is from our sense organs. What GuruJi advised us is that our MAN influenced by the five evils executes undesired actions (in Gurbani e.g. **ਖਟ ਕਰਮ, ਨੀਚ ਕਰਮ, ਮਨਮੁਖ ਕਰਮ, ਮਨਹਠਿ ਕਰਮ, ਅਧਿਆਤਮ ਕਰਮ, ਹਉਮੈ ਕਰਮ, ਮਾਇਆ ਕਰਮ**) through our action organs and these are a part of MAYA. These are the MAYA related actions that GuruJi is talking about and these are what the Views A and B are relating to. GuruJi is saying these actions, that we perform, are not going to lead us on the TRUE path and that we must use discriminative intelligence (**ਬਿਬੇਕ ਬੁਧੀ**) acquired from Gurbani. The people may innocently be doing these actions, due to being mislead, but may not benefit spiritually (**depending on what is going on in their minds** (spirituality **ਅਧਿਆਤਮ**) - the example of Guru Nanak and Kadhi above refers). The appropriate actions (in Gurbani e.g. **ਗੁਰਮੁਖਿ ਕਰਮ, ਹੁਕਮੇ ਕਰਮ**), which we will know through **discriminative intelligence** as well as Gurbani, will help us to move in the right direction. However it is through CONTEMPLATION AND REFLECTION will we understand Gurbani and attain God realisation.

The question is **why LOGIC and REASONING which is the hallmark of the modern world as View B says is not the spiritual solution**. We shall now look at this.

- Stephen Hawkings (source Stephen Hawking, A Breif History of Time) in 1968-1970 introduced the concept of singularity theorem by “demonstrating that for every solution to the equations to the general relativity guarantees the existence of a singular boundary for space and time in the past”. This was the mathematical realisation for the big bang theory. However, this showed the Universe to have a beginning. Steven Hawking was expecting a “no beginning or end” for the Universe. He tried to use imaginary time in further analysis to show this. This failed to provide acceptable results. Finally the stand was that the **universe had a beginning and the laws of science break down at this point**.
- H F Schaefer III, (source: The big bang, Stephen Hawking, and God, 2004 New College Lecture Series, University of Georgia Athens, Georgia) states that Albert Einstein, when realising that his general theory of relativity (1915) pointed to a beginning, added a cosmological constant or a fudge factor to make it appear to have no beginning, to which he later conceded was “one of the few serious mistakes of his scientific career”.

- H F Schaefer III, (source: The big bang, Stephen Hawking, and God, 2004 New College Lecture Series, University of Georgia Athens, Georgia) states that Leon Lederman in his book “The God Particle” states that “in the very beginning, there was a void - a curious form of vacuum - a nothingness containing no space, no time, no matter, no light, no sound”. He continues on to say “we are in the realm of philosophy. **Only GOD knows what happened at the very beginning**”.

These great scientists, knowledgeable in the area of Cosmos, clearly state that **logic, reasoning, mathematics; generally no matter how much our knowledge, fails at the beginning of the creation or the creator;**

Therefore God is BEYOND LOGIC AND REASON. We cannot use LOGIC/REASON to realise God. We have to go beyond LOGIC and REASON to realise God.

This is exactly what GuruJi stated

ਸੋਚੈ ਸੋਚਿ ਨ ਹੋਵਈ ਜੇ ਸੋਚੀ ਲਖ ਵਾਰ ॥ SGGS 1 JapJi

By thinking, He cannot be reduced to thought, even by thinking hundreds of thousands of times.

This is precisely why logic and reasoning is not enough and this is substantiated by Gurbani as well as through scientific research. Also note some statements, from people “who have attained realisation”, on this matter.

- Gurbani is DEVOTIONAL rather than philosophical and MORAL rather than cerebral (source: Sikh Encyclopaedia Vol 4 p. 248).
- The man, whose acquaintance with the world does not lead him deeper than science leads him, will never understand what it is that the man with the spiritual vision finds in these natural phenomena. The water does not merely cleanse his limbs, but it purifies his heart; for it touches his soul. The earth does not merely hold his body, but it gladdens his mind; for its contact is more than a physical contact - it is a living presence. (source: Sadhana: The Realization of Life – Rabindranath Tagore).

The “living presence”, which Rabindranath Tagore mentions, is the presence of God in the creation which Gurbani refers to as Hukam (ਹੁਕਮ) and Jot (ਜੋਤ).

NOTE: This is what Rabiindernath Tagore stated about Arti when asked to write an Arti for the world; “It has already been written, not only for the world but for the entire universe. It was written in the 16th century by Guru Nanak” (source: “The Jagannath Temple and the Sikh Arti” by Anil Dhir, Odisha Review Feb-Mar 2012)

Therefore the “View A” **says the logic and reasoning is MANMAT is correct to a large extent.** This is because we have shown that WITHOUT GURBANI TEACHING WE CANNOT USE OUR LOGIC OR REASONING to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) as this will be biased by our five evils.

Many diversions from what our Gurus taught us through Gurbani are presently observed around us. For example there is an overzealous trend by some Sikh academics/preachers to fit the teachings of Gurbani into Science/logic/reasoning and in the process distort some of the concepts to meet with what they think are suitable for MODERN times. Though Gurbani talks about the creation and the universe and our role in it, it is by no means a treatise on cosmos/science. Science and Religion serve two different purposes as Gurbani, the Encyclopaedia of Sikhism, and Nobel laureate Rabindranath Tagore clearly point out above.

As an example of this overzealous trend we present an interpretation which is misleading. The article “How do we interpret Gurbani?” by Prof Devinder Singh Chahal, PhD on page 16 of Sikh Bulletin, Volume 18 Number 7 & 8, July-August 2016 available at “<http://sikhbulletin.com/Bulletins/SikhBulletinJulAug2016.pdf>” refers.

The author’s interpretation is

ਦੁਖੁ ਦਾਰੂ ਸੁਖੁ ਰੋਗੁ ਭਇਆ ਜਾ ਸੁਖੁ ਤਾਮਿ ਨ ਹੋਈ ॥ SGGS 469

When somebody is living pleasurable and sedentary life, one becomes prone to a number of diseases/troubles/problems. However, those who exert (take pain/trouble) in workouts (structured regime of physical exercise) are resistant to these issues. The workouts become the medicine/remedy to prevent all such diseases/troubles/problems; or (in other words), once a pleasurable and healthy life is achieved through proper workouts, then no such diseases can occur.

Though the translation by the author appears SCIENTIFIC, LOGICAL and with REASONING, it does not give the message of Gurbani, in fact it is misleading, implying that Gurbani is teaching us to exercise. A book on exercise would provide more details on benefits and outcomes.

The meaning of the Shabad as we perceive it is

God is pervading the whole creation and God’s limit cannot be known. Suffering (ਦੁਖੁ) reminds me of God (ਦਾਰੂ) and pleasures (ਸੁਖੁ/ਜਾ ਸੁਖੁ) distract me from God (ਰੋਗੁ ਭਇਆ/ਤਾਮਿ ਨ ਹੋਈ). Remembering God one realises that God is within (inside) and without (outside) the creation and Praising God (through Naam which is the story of God – the all-powerful doer) one attains salvation.

This example clearly show what happens when one is devoid of the quality of “living presence” (as Rabindranath Tagore explains) in the knowledge and interpretation of Gurbani and tries to interpret Gurbani solely using logic and reasoning.

There are many other cases where an extreme interpretation of our Gurus writings are being made and are causing a divide in the Sangat. We just have to look around us diligently and these will come out glaringly.

Conclusion

“View A” that “logic and reasoning” is Manmat (ਮਨਮਤਿ) is correct to a large extent. This is because we use Gurbani teachings or Gurmat to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) otherwise our decisions will be biased by our five evils.

In relation to “View B” it is a **folly to interpret Gurbani** based solely on **logic and reasoning** without accepting the “living presence”, the presence of God in the creation which Gurbani refers to as Hukam (ਹੁਕਮ) and Jot (ਜੋਤ). Further without Gurbani teaching (Gurmat) we **cannot use our logic or reasoning** to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) as this will be biased by our five evils. **Our Gurus had decided through their own methods what we are to learn** through all our scriptures and **our role** is to **contemplate and reflect** on these teachings and then put them into **practice**.

Without Gurbani teaching (Gurmat) we **cannot use our logic or reasoning** to decide on what is right (good) and what is wrong (bad) as this will be biased by our five evils.

Relying on logic and/or reasoning can result in misinterpretation of Gurbani and preaching this to the Sangat will do a disservice to the Sangat as well as cause a divide in the Sangat.